Why & How Women Liberate Themselves under Literary Paternity?

—The representations of women’s liberation in *The Hours* by Michael Cunningham

& *The Color Purple* by Alice Walker.

YU Hsiao Min

Acknowledgement

I would like to present my sincere thank to Dr. Chan Shun Hing from the Cultural Studies Department, Lingnan University for her kind guidance and support in enabling the completion of this research project. An acknowledgement is also given to the colleagues in the course CUS513E Feminism and Cultural Politics of Master of Cultural Studies for their genuine discussion and intellectual interflows. This research project could not be implemented without your invaluable contribution.

Abstract

Women’s liberation has been a common issue widely discussed in contemporary literatures. This is a textual analysis on two contemporary English novels *The Hours* by Michael Cunningham and *The Color Purple* by Alice Walker writing on the same feminist theme of “women’s liberation” and their representation of women’s liberation under literary paternity. The first part will elaborate the authors’
suggestions for the reasons for women’s request on liberation and the practical means to achieve women’s liberation based on the case studies on four selected female characters at the content-level. The second part will analyze the significance of the ways of presenting the concerned theme in the two novels in response to dualistic gender differences contributing to literary paternity at the narrative-level.

This research project aims at firstly arguing that liberating one’s self from social suppressions is essential for women to survive under literary paternity with reference to the two novels which describe the lives of four selected female characters coming from various generations and contexts. A further attempt of this paper is to display the possible violation of literary paternity through the narration of “women’s liberation” in the two novels from the perspective of feminist criticism.

**About the Topic**

The rationale behind the formation of the research topic is closely related to the perception of literary paternity acquired in the research seminar of CUS 513E. The traditional literary paternity has caused weighty impacts on social stereotype of genders and thus women have been suppressed and controlled by men in the authentic world (Gilbert & Gubar, 1984). In order to deconstruct the phallogocentric
system coined by J. Derrida, the foundation of the construction of literary paternity, French feminists have been promoting a consciousness of feminist discourse in literature. As a research exercise of the course, the topic has set to be an attempt of interpreting the two renowned contemporary novels from a feminist perspective based on the principles of the school of French.

Being a case study of the research, there are a several reasons for selecting the two novels. First of all, both novels written in 90’s have shared a feminist theme of “women’s liberation” and have obtained attention of readers over the world with their prize-winning stories. Secondly, all the protagonists are female characters who have encountered suppression from family and society which is commonly faced by women in the patriarchy world in reality. Besides, it is interesting to compare the innovative narrative styles applied in these contemporary novels writing on the same theme by authors of different genders with regards to the issues of gender consciousness in literature.

**Organization of the Paper**

In the paper, the two selected novels and the studied characters will first be introduced, followed by the illustration of the key concepts of terminology and theory
involved in this research, the methodology, the presentation of research findings at
the content-level and the narrative-level respectively and finally the reflections with a
conclusion.

Introduction to the Selected Novels and Characters

There are two novels selected for case studies. *The Hours* (1998) is a fiction written
by American male author Michael Cunningham and later being adapted into a film. It
concerns a day of three women protagonists coming from various generations and
settings, in which their thoughts and experience in the day are all affected by the book
*Mrs. Dalloway* by Virginia Woolf, one of the protagonists. The novel is written in a
narrative style of stream-of-consciousness and mirrors largely the plot and writing
style of the authentic book *Mrs. Dalloway* (1925) by the real feminist writer Virginia
Woolf (1882-1941).

In this research, the three female protagonists in *The Hours* have been selected as
cases studied. The first character is Virginia Woolf from the setting of Richmond,
Suburb of London in 1923, which is adapted from the feminist writer of the same
name in real. She stays in Richmond for recovery from mental illness with her
husband, yet always wants to escape to London. The novel has given an account of a
day of her writing her latest novel *Mrs. Dalloway* during her struggle against the
illness, in which later she changes her mind and decides to let the character Mrs.
Dalloway to survive in her book whereas she kills herself at last.

Another character chosen for study is Laura Brown, a housewife pregnant for her
second child, coming from Los Angeles in 1949, who takes good care of all domestic
work, her husband and her son Richie. She loves reading a lot and is currently
reading the book *Mrs. Dalloway*. She spends a day preparing a birthday cake for her
husband, but later decides to leave her family after being inspired by *Mrs. Dalloway*
and her friend Kitty’s visit in the afternoon.

The final character from *The Hours* studied is Clarissa Vaughn the lesbian writer
living with her partner in the New York City of 1999. She has been called “Mrs.
Dalloway” by her former lover and best friend Richard who is an award-winning poet
dying of AIDS. Her day in the novel of preparing a party for the celebration of
Richard’s prize winning has depicted her love and care of this dying friend, however,
Richard is found killing himself in the latter part of the novel and thus Clarissa is no
longer “Mrs. Dalloway”.

On the other hand, the second novel selected as research subject is *The Color Purple* (1982) by Alice Walker, the African-American feminist writer who has coined the new idea of “Womanism” (the concern of women with colour apart from the White). The novel is a life story of Celie, a poor African-American girl in the setting of rural Georgia, America, in 1930’s. The story is portrayed by a series of letters mainly written by Celie to God and her transformation from a poor life controlled by men as a Black woman into an independent life is the focus of the novel.

In fact the protagonist Celie in *The Color Purple* is the final female character studied in this research. The story begins at her age of fourteen where her letters reveal that this poor and uneducated girl has been being oppressed by most male characters appear in the novel, including her stepfather, her husband and her step-son. In the first half of her life, she has been separated from her beloved sister and is forced to do all domestic as well as outdoor agricultural work at daytime and be a sex salve at night, and thus she starts to write letters to God expressing all her experience and feelings.

Later on, she meets Shug, her husband’s former lover, and has sex with her. After friendship is developed between Shug and her, Shug shows her the letters from her sister which have been hidden by her husband since the very beginning and so Celie
starts to write letters to her sister with hope. At the end of the novel, Celie curses her husband at the dining table, complaining him for ruining her whole life. After she liberates herself from the family, she sets up her pants-making business with the assistance from Shug and has at last achieved an independent life and the reunion with her sister.

The four characters who are Virginia Woolf, Laura Brown and Clarissa Vaughn from *The Hours* and Celie from *The Color Purple* have been introduced and it is believed that the understanding of these research subjects will help comprehending the significance of the presentation of “women’s liberation” in the two contemporary fictions in the following sections.

**Introduction to the Key Concepts involved**

In order to provide the research with a framework, a several key concepts of terminology and theory involved in the paper will be explained in this part.

**A) Metaphor of Literary Paternity**

The metaphor of literary paternity has been thoroughly analyzed and presented in the paper by Gilbert and Gubar (1984). It is illustrated in their text that “Authority” or
“Authorship” in literature has always been regarded as a male-dominant feature since “pen” symbolizes “penis”. Since mastering a “pen” is much more significant than mastering a “sword” as the previous one offers power to gain homage in long-term, and this an author represents a “spiritual type of a patriarch” (p.7, Gilbert & Gubar, 1984).

There are some reasons for the male-domination of literature. The first factor is a kind of perception of female’s subordination to male caused by the patriarchal mythology in Bible for there is a description of women being created by, from and for men. According to Ortnder (1998), the difference between female and male determined by Nature is another cause of this perception, in which female is naturally deprived from power and autonomy by the time they realize their lack of penis. It is interesting that Ortnder’s view from the socio-cultural perspective can be associated to Freudian explanation of “Penis Envy”. This perception has constructed a belief that writing, reading and thinking (i.e. creativity) are male characteristics or male activities and only men have owned the obligation and ability to talk back with pens.

Understanding the formation of literary paternity, one can reckon the suppression of women in male texts where the pens of men have possessed the power to give lives to
or kill female characters in literature. Thanks to the traditionally literary paternity,
two stereotypes of women can be found in male texts. The first stereotype is
“Angels” representing the feminine symbols of transcendence such as a domestic
housewife and merciful mother while the next stereotype is “Monsters” illustrating all
feminine symbols of subversion, the castrating women and trollop for instance.
Regardless of the differences represented by these two extreme stereotypes, women
are shown to enjoy no autonomy or subjectivity as they are purely created and
controlled by men’s pen. In a deeper sense of consciousness of gender, it is believed
that the only representations of women images as being worshiped or being feared by
men in literature is actually a projection of male’s mental fear for women.

Apart from women’s images in male texts, literary paternity has also caused impacts
on people’s perception of gender stereotype in reality. Since “pen” is a powerful tool
to rule over thoughts of people as described above, women have been nurtured to
agree with their images given by literary paternity that they should not cross the
boundaries dictated by Nature. Besides, social limitations such as education
opportunity for girls (especially in the olden days) have favoured men’s monopoly on pens and the authority over women.
As a result, female’s thoughts and fate are framed and designed by men, the authors in literature and in real life, and therefore women are encouraged to set their goal as to perform the perfect image of “angel in the house”. As for the women attempting to create their own texts with pens, they will be regarded as presumptuous and “inconstancy” (p. 16, Gilbert & Gubar, 1984).

B) Écriture féminine—Feminist Writing

In response to the consequences and suppression to women led by literary paternity, Feminist activists have proposed to establish a new perspective of feminist writing. This research is conducted based on the inspiration of literary criticism raised by the school of French Feminism, in which their studies have put a focus on language or discourse in literature in order to show opposition to the phallogocentric system, coined by J. Derrida, reflected in literary paternity (Chan, 2007).

According to the school of French Feminism, the definition of feminist writing should be determined by “textuality of sex” instead of “sexuality of texts” (pp.20, Chan, 2007). Supported by Representationalism, a feminist text is regarded as a text able to show feminine characteristics in discourse and feminist autonomy, a feminine gender of discourse, where the author’s sex is not a determinant (Jacobus, 1986). In a feminist writing, women characters enjoy the sense of own autonomy to authorize
over their own experience, in which female have had the power to create themselves
as the characters they intend to be and to help other women get rid of their
male-designed fate.

Since it is reckoned that a text signifies body of women, writing offers a pleasure
from creativity and enables female to confront their needs of body that being read and
listened, the French school of Feminism has emphasized the building up of a
women’s discourse as a weapon to fight against the political environment of
patriarchy. The methods of achieving the aim include the deconstruction of male
discourse under the phallogocentric system and the development and design of a
female discourse.

To build up a female discourse, women are encouraged to join the practice of writing
as a form of liberation. Although Virginia Woolf, the renowned feminist writer, is not
considered as typical of the French School in feminist literary theories, she has made
an inspiring remark on the conditions for “women’s writing”. In A Room of One’s
Own (1929), she states that “In the first place, to have a room of her own… was out
of the question, unless her parents were exceptionally rich or very noble”, where she
expressed n in Professions for Women (1979) that it is necessary to “kill the angel in
the house” before a woman can write. This research will assess the possibility for women to write regarding to Woolf’s viewpoints.

C) The Marginalized & Liberation

In the research, both novels have presented stories of female characters being marginalized seeking for liberation. Marginalization is social process of relegating certain persons to a lower social standing, usually through power deprivation. (Mullaly, 2007) where another common form of marginalization is material deprivation which unfairly material resources dispersed in society (Young, 2000).

Women can be marginalized through suffering from deprivation at different levels, such as the exclusion of raped women from political participation at the individual level and deprivation of Black people at the community level. In the novels, the female protagonists have been deprived from power and/or materials at the individual and community levels respectively.

As for liberation, it refers to the mental process of setting one’s self free through taking various actions, for instance, reading, writing and touching one another (Freire,
1970). It is at collective efficacy and is essential for surviving “in a world that sometimes tries to kill us”, as it offers the hope for achieving a better world in people’s heart (Harro, 2000). The purposes of liberation include developing a sense of self, taking charge of one’s own destiny of life as well as creating the world that people want to live.

**D) Discourse in Literature**

In the second half of the research, focus has been put on “discourse” instead of the contents of the novels. Chan has recounted in her book about the separation of “story” and “discourse” based on the idea of S. Chatman (p.1, Chan, 2007), with “story” refers to the settings, plot, characters and all their behaviour in the text while “discourse” means how the “story” is presented (Chatman, 1978). In other words, the representation of the same theme of “stories” about women’s liberation in the two novels may have conveyed different messages which are determined by “discourse”.

Inspired by R. Barthes and T. Todorov, a clearer definition of “discourse” can be made as “the choices of narrative style determining how the text finally appears to the audience” (p.2, Chan, 2007) by its descriptive functions. G. Genette claims that the narrative reflects the relationship between all participations involved in the novel,
which includes “implied author”, “narrator”, “narratee”, “implied reader” and other existing characters (Rimmon-Kenan, 1989) and can be examined by analyzing, for instance, the perspectives and voice adopted in the texts. Moreover, “discourse” is regarded by M. Foucault as a tool to establish “power” through the construction of “statement” in the novel (Chan, 2007).

E) The Narrative Style of a Text

In order to analyze the representation of discourse in the two novels, the research has undertaken the analysis on narrative approaches applied in the texts by the two authors in four aspects, including the Narrative Mode, Narrative Voice, the Authority represented by different narrative style and the Point of View. The four aspects will be further elaborated in the following parts of presenting the research findings.

The Methodology

As introduced in advance, the research has been developed into two sections of reflecting the significance of women’s liberation implied by the encounters of four female protagonists and the representation of the narrative style adopted by the two authors over the same feminist theme in relation to the novels’ “textuality of sex” respectively. The previous section will illustrate the results of case studies on the four
characters, with inspirations from the integrated theories about Marginalization and
Liberation as explained earlier, based on the psychological transforming process of
the women from being marginalized to the implementation of self-liberation under
literary paternity. This section will also indicate the two directions of women
attaining liberation, which are through body touch and language, as suggested by the
authors via the studied characters’ experience in the novels.

As for the latter section focusing on the narrative level of the novels, literary criticism
from the perspective of the French school of Feminism will be applied with the
support of T. Todorov’s theories on “discourse” in literature. The organization of the
analysis is based on the research framework used in a similar study on Chinese
novels by Chan Shun Hing in her publication of Narrative and Gender in
Contemporary Chinese Literature (revised edition) (2007). This framework, inspired
by R. Warhol as indicated in Chan’s study, aims at studying the narrative style of the
two selected novels of the research and their significance with respect to gender
duality under phallogocentric system, where it will review the various features of
narrative style as well as point of view applied in the two novels, followed by the
comparison of the narrative approaches used by the two authors and will examine the
novels’ contribution to the establishment of feminist writing.
Analysis on Psychological Transformation of the Four Female Characters

The first half of this research will analyze women’s needs on liberation from the suppression in the patriarchal world and then the possible ways for women striving for liberation.

Why do women seek for liberation?

It is not difficult to comprehend the reasons for women to seek for liberation as the similarities of struggle shared by the four cases in the novels have indicated factors. This section will present the two main factors of the “sense of playing a role” and the marginalization of the characters which cause the intense desire for seeking for liberation.

A) Living with a Sense of “Playing a Role”

The first and the most eventful reason for the characters to seek for liberation is the failure to be their true self as living with a sense of “playing a role”, in which they have all been behaving according to the social norm accepted by the majority in society only for the purpose of satisfying the needs or expectations of others, mainly
male characters like their husbands and sons as shown in the novels, instead of themselves.

In *The Color Purple*, Celie has been taking the role as a domestic helper for her family as well as a sex slave for her husband, yet has never gained any respect from her husband and her step-son as a wife or a mother. She understands her husband marries her for a “Good housekeeper, good with children, good cook” (p.21) which is regarded as “women work” (p.22) by her step-son, implying her role as a domestic helper at home. And thus even on the wedding day, she is ordered by her husband to “bandage my (her) head… and cook dinner” right after her step-son “laid (her) head open” (p.12). These have reflected Celie’s life of acting only as a maid for the family rather than herself as a woman.

Furthermore, the three female characters in *The Hours* have also been taking a role for satisfying others’ expectation throughout their lives. Clarissa Vaughan has been playing the role of “Mrs. Dalloway” for Richard upon his wish. As indicated in the novel, Clarissa, being “Richard’s oldest friend, his first reader…..even some of his more recent friends have come to imagine he’s died” (p.65), is assumed to be the one taking care of this abandoned and dying old friend. Later when Richard is dead,
“...here she is, herself, Clarissa, not Mrs. Dalloway anymore; there is no one now to call her that.” (p.226), disclosing that all the time Clarissa plays the role of “Mrs. Dalloway” is an act for satisfying Richard’s desire.

Another character struggling in the similar situation is Laura Brown, who has to act as a considerate and responsible wife and pregnant mother in front of her husband. An obvious evidence of her acting is that whenever she wants a cigarette in front of her husband, she “changes her mind” (p.44, 45) because she is a pregnant mother and not supposed to smoke, however, without her husband’s presence, “she lights a cigarette” (p.48) as a causal way to relief herself. Neglecting the fact that Laura loves reading “to calm and locate herself” (p.38) when she is alone, she in fact knows clearly it is her “obligation” (p.38) for taking up all the domestic work and showing her love and care to her family, as if she is “about to go onstage and perform in a play” (p.43). To Laura, this “obligation” of playing the role is irresistible for her husband has chosen her, “What could she says but yes?” (p.40) and her husband and son need her so much. There is an additional perception forcing her not to be her true self as men who contribute to the War deserve for enjoying a good family “because the war is over” (p.42).
For Virginia Woolf in *The Hours*, she has been acting as a patient of mental illness with a good recovering progress in front of her husband as well as an authoritative mistress in front of servants. Providing that she has poor servant skills in the novel, she tells her maid to go to London and get the tea immediately (p.86) in order to perform the authority as a mistress, which is a vital quality for the image of a perfect housewife. She also admits that she “acts more firmly healthy than she sometimes feels” (p.71) in her husband’s presence and she lies to him that “Nothing happened” (p.171) when he catches her escaping to London. From the evidence above, she understands she should not make her husband worried for being a perfect wife and behaving “sane” is the only way for her husband to approve the move back to London.

These are all the roles where the women in the novel take in their lives. With the aim of satisfying other male characters’ expectation and needs, the female characters are forbidden to live their life according to their own will and in other words, they have to hide their true self. It is noticeable that, women in these novels have in fact shown their self-consciousness as they understand completely their ways of living have been being controlled and oppressed by the male characters in the patriarchal society, and thus their increasing desire for locating their true self through liberation by time is
unavoidable.

**B) Being Marginalized**

It has been introduced earlier in this paper the definition of marginalization, where the marginalized party is deprived of his or her power or materials at the individual or community levels. The most apparent case of the marginalized person in this research is Celie, the Black heroine in *The Color Purple*, who has actually suffered from double-marginalization due to her gender and race.

One may first assess her power deprivation as a woman at the individual level. In the novel, the first line has highlighted the reason for Celie to write letters to God as her step-father threatens that “You better not tell nobody but God” about her experience of being raped by him as “it’d kill your mammy” (p.1) and thus Celie has no channel to express her miseries. And since her first writing to God, there is seldom a signature or a sender’s name at the end in her letters which signifies her “nobodyness” and a low self-esteem, leading to her powerlessness to voice out for herself self-protection.

At the early stage of her life, Celie has pointed out a common impression that “a good wife” must be “Good to children and good looking. Hardworking. Godfearing and
clean”, an angelic female image, and therefore she is not a good wife as “she ugly” (p.8) and not “fresh” (p.7) or clean as being raped by her step-father. It explains the reasons for her deprivation of being respected with an image of the unclean “Monster” as her step-father “Say I’m evil an always up to no good” (p.3) even though it is him who ruins Celie.

Apart from power deprivation at the individual level, Celie’s life experience in *The Color Purple* also reflects the power deprivation of the Black at the community-level. There is an eye-catching comparison between the White Reverend’s addresses of “gal” to Celie and “girl” to a White lady respectively (p.14), which implies that the Reverend has shown more respect to the White lady with a formal and polite address than that to the Black Celie with a casual and informal address. Another implication of the similarity of lack financial power among the Black women has been made in the novel when Celie describes the Reverend’s wife, who is a White woman, “the only woman I even seen with money” (p.19). As a matter of fact, although her friend “Yellowish Squeak” sings a song of Racism complaining her identity given by her colour (p.101), Celie still find that “I see all this yellow powder caked up on her (Shug’s) face” (p.45) to cover her black skin as a usual practice for Black women to attract male’s attention.
On the other hand, female has come across material deprivation in terms of a lack of a private space, an important space for expression one’s real thoughts and feeling, which urges women to seek for a way to perform their true self as liberation. Besides Celie the poor girl who never owns a space even just for keeping the letters from her sister, the female characters in The Hours have encountered the similar situation too.

Clarissa Vaughn has shown an impressive illustration of the “sense of dislocation” (p.91) when she is in her own kitchen. Though “she and Sally (her partner living together) bought all these things”, she still feels that “this is not her kitchen at all” while observing her own house with “wonder and detachment” (p.90-91). This odd feeling allows her to realize her lack of a sense of belonging in which she actually “owns nothing” (p.92), not even a private place belongs to her where she feels comfortable to present her true self.

Similar to Clarissa, Laura has also suffered from the lack of her own private space. For Laura, she lives with her husband and son, which means she has been living in a shared place. When she is reading books in her bedroom, her emphasis on “no, their bedroom” (p.37) has denied the bedroom being a possessive space of Laura her own self but to be shared by her husband. In fact, this has later resulted in Laura renting a
hotel room for a space to read, leaving her son to a friend and making her son hates her so much since then.

In short, the prohibition of owning a feminine private space has become another significant factor forcing women to strive for a way to express their true selves besides the deprivation of female’s power under social patriarchy.

**How do Women Seek for Liberation?**

Women’s liberation, as described previously, can be achieved through various kinds of action which can be divided into two aspects. The first aspect of body touch will be presented in this part while the second aspect of language-related actions will be elaborated in the next section.

*A) Liberation through Body Touch among the Same Sex*

Body touch is a way of liberating one’s self as described in the two novels among the female characters with no assistance from men. There are two kinds of body touch to achieve women’s liberation, where both have involved at least two women with a support of sisterhood.
The first kind of body touch is kissing in *The Hours* in which all three female protagonists have had kissing scenes with the same-sex characters. First of all, Laura kisses her friend Kitty who suffers from her uterus problem, a women’s sickness, in the kitchen while it is a feminine space for them to discuss women’s issues without men’s presence. Although there are not much clues implying Laura for possessing a sexual preference for female in the book, it is interesting that she shows curious to experience a man’s patent to kiss a woman when she encourages Kitty to “forget about Ray (Kitty’s husband) for a minute… just forget him” (p.110) during the kiss, while “they are each impersonating someone” (p.110). It seems that her interest in seeing how a man feels when kissing a woman is affected by the homosexual character of Virginia Woolf revealed in her book *Mrs. Dalloway* and it is indeed a channel for her to be liberated from family duties.

For Clarissa, she kisses Barbara and thinks that “the moment is suddenly, unexpectedly perfect” (p.24) and by admitting her enjoyment for kissing a woman, she declares her sexual preference for women (either homosexual or bisexual) through the action. Despite the fact that she has been taking the role of “Mrs. Dalloway” for her beloved Richard throughout the first-half of her life, she still enjoys the moments of kissing a woman, offering her pleasure and the sense of self.
Although Virginia seems to show a sexual preference for female too, her kisses with her sister Vanessa has instead provided a presentation of sisterhood. The book describes that the kiss has offered them “the most delicious and forbidden pleasure” (p.154), while “pleasure” here is interpreted as the sharing happiness of sisterhood, illustrating the intimate relationship between the two women with mutual support and understanding. Furthermore, it is worthy to note that Virginia has associated kisses with “London” and “freedom” (p.172), as therefore kissing can be interpreted as an action to express her true desires for freedom and moving back to London which contributes to the presentation of her self-consciousness.

Apart from liberation through kissing, the other action taken by Celie in The Color Purple as a mean to liberate herself is sexual act (love-making) with Shug. It is Shug who first proposes sex with Celie and it is so enjoyable that it “…feel like one of my (Celie’s) little lost babies mouth” (p.115). To Celie, this sexual act is very different from that with men before, which would only cause painful experiences to her. Through the process of helping each other in achieving sexual pleasure, same-sex love-making has meant a self-discovery of gaining a kind of private pleasure and liberation from sexual violence in reality.
It is worthy to note that the sexual act between these two women has involved elements of affections and emotions, where Celie “cry and cry and cry” and says “I love you” (p.114) after the act is finished. Similar to Virginia Woolf and her sister Vanessa, there is a sense of sisterhood implied when Celie writes “Us sleep like sisters, me and Shug” (p.146). The existence of sisterhood has become a consolation to Celie, liberating her from her painful life in reality with support and understanding among the female characters.

Looking at a larger picture of liberation through body touch including kisses and sexual acts among the same-sex does not only offer private sexual pleasure to women, which is traditionally male-dominant, but more importantly has served as a platform for women to support each other and so to obtain personal psychological development together. In addition, the loving relationship between Celie and Shug as well serves as a possible signification of a break from patriarchy via the means of sexuality.

**B) Liberation through Language (Writing & Reading)**

When talking about liberation through language, it is not difficult to spot that most characters in the two novels as enthusiastic in writing or reading. Virginia Woolf, who
is literally a writer in *The Hours*, loves writing and “would like to write all day” (p.69). Writing is an essential form of liberation to Virginia as she is able to create a book that “finally matches her expectations” of life (p.69) for she can project all her own desires on her characters reacted. For instance, Mrs. Dalloway is assigned to be a London city woman with good skills of servant who would survive at the end of her book, indicating all her wishes that cannot be achieved in the real world. Moreover, it is illustrated that writing liberates Virginia from her mental illness and “she works, always, against the fear of relapse” (p.70). She believes that writing is a proof of her self-identity while struggling with mental disorder as she once encourages herself to continue writing by saying “having faith that you will be here, recognizable to yourself, again tomorrow” (p.72). And thus, writing has become a channel for Virginia to seek for satisfaction and expression of her true desires of life.

As for Celie in *The Color Purple*, she as well finds a way of liberation through writing since she starts writing letters to God after being raped by her step-father for God is the only trustable and possible receiver of her letters. By writing letters, she is able to express her true affections and thoughts without any concerns of taboos. For instance, she honestly writes “I don’t even look at mens. That’s the truth. I look at women, tho…” (p.5) while it may contain clues implying that she could possibly be a
lesbian at the beginning of the story. Also, being a girl always subordinate to other male characters, Celie has demonstrated power to control over her descriptions of other people in her letters, for example, by addressing her husband with surname hidden as “Mr. ____” in order to show that he represents no significance in her mind. As a remark, a high frequency of the use of the personal pronoun “I” is found in Celie’s letters, which reflects the gradual construction of her self-identity via writing. And therefore the letters serving as a private diary to express one’s self has functioned as a means of liberation for Celie to establish a sense of self.

Besides liberation by writing, Laura Brown in The Hours has adopted another language-relation action, reading, for liberating herself. Being suppressed by the family live, Laura reaches for her books automatically before starting a day of taking care of her family in every morning, “as if reading were the singular and obvious first task of the day, the only viable way to negotiate the transit from sleep to obligation” (p.38), allowing her to escape from her roles in the family in other words. Reading helps Laura to “calm and locate herself” (p.38) that when she reads, she is “Laura Zielski (her former surname before getting married), the solitary girl, the incessant reader” (p.40), her true self.
One may pay attention to the choice of books Laura reads. Her desire to read “all of Virginia Woolf, book by book” (p.42) has reflected that not only Virginia Woolf who commits suicide to refuse the suppression given by the patriarchal world has become her role model to learn from, but also the character Mrs. Dollaway created by Woolf as hinted by the another inter-textual character Clarissa Dollaway in the same novel. The story then reveals that Laura likes imagination which could be an implication of a primary instinct of being a writer, another means to achieve women’s liberation as mentioned before.

The analysis above has presented a common feature of writing and reading as liberation, in which by expressing one’s true identity via writing as well as escaping from reality and learning from other women via reading, these actions have allowed the women in the novels to create a world they want to live and have offered an opportunity for them to take authority and autonomy over their own fate.

_The Portray of Women’s Liberation in the two Novels_

Before moving on to analyzing the narrative approaches used in the novels when portraying this feminist theme, one may conclude the representations of experience encountered by the studied characters in the two novels with respect to the
suggestions of meaning and practical means of striving for women’s liberation.

The first message presented by the stories is that the social suppression faced by women determined by gender differences in the patriarchal world has possessed a universal nature. There is not much improvement shown on this cultural and social issue of genders throughout generations and settings—from the age of the authentic Virginia Woolf who kills herself to resist the oppression from society to post-war settings in the stories of Celie and Laura Brown and then the contemporary context of Clarissa Vaughn. The theme of women’s suppression by men and their liberation is still a hot topic found in the studied contemporary fictions in this research. In addition, all the concerned female characters have come to scarify their families for freedom at the end of the novels, in which it again matches with Virginia Woolf’s notion of “angels” (women’s obedience to patriarchal influence in writing) must be “killed” for women’s liberation.

When looking at a larger picture of the significance of the two novels, the texts have also demonstrated that all women can write their own texts in response to the perception of the traditional literary paternity. Certainly, most women can read and write in present days resulting that more feminist texts can be possibly created, in
which women can learn from and the awareness of female’s self-consciousness can be raised.

In addition, Alice Walker, the author of The Color Purple, has once criticized Virginia Woolf’s viewpoints on the conditions of “women writing” for her exclusion of women of colour & poor women who do not even own a private room, and thus she attempts to demonstrate her belief against Woolf’s opinion with her novel. By narrating Celie’s liberation through writing in difficulties even though she is poor, not owning a room or even herself, uneducated and is “silly”, Walker has displayed her notion of “Womanism”, or “the Black feminism”, that concerning women suffer from double-marginalization.

************************************

Analysis on the Narrative Approaches of the two Novels

In the second-half of the research, the ways of presentation the stories in the two novels will be analyzed and their inspirations of dualistic gender differences under literary paternity will be suggested later. The analysis will be based on four issues including the Narrative Modes and the Narrative Voice which indicate the Narrative Authority of the novels, followed by the Point of View that the authors applied when
writing the stories.

A) The Narrative Modes

In a novel, there are several participants involved including an implied author, the narrator, the narratee(s) and the implied reader(s) (Rimmon-Kenan, 1989, in Chan, 2007) and Chan (2007) has suggested two categories to distinguish the positions held by the narrator in a text. The first category is to assess whether the narrator is “participating in the story” (“同故事”, p.8, Chan, 2007) who is one of the characters inside the story, or “not participating in the story” (“異故事”, p.8, 2007) while the second category defines whether the consciousness of narrator is “bounded in the story” (“故事內”, p.8, Chan, 2007) or “flows beyond the story” (“故事外”, p.8, Chan, 2007), or in other words, to examine if the narration flows with a particular character’s conscious in a fixed time and place or is allowed to master things happening in all settings and on various characters. Four narrative modes and thus can be classified according to the two categories above and two of the modes have been involved in the subjects of this research.

The first type of narrative mode can be found in The Hours for “not participating in the story” (“異故事”) + “flows beyond the story” (“故事外”) for the third-person
omniscient narrative has been applied. Some features of this narrative mode are presented in *The Hours* and the first one is its nature of “time flashing”. The novel has been passing through three stories of a day’s experience of Virginia Woolf who comes from Richmond in 1923, Laura Brown from Los Angeles 1949 and Clarissa Vaughn from 1999’s New York, and thus it reflects the narrator’s ability to travel through one setting (time and space) to another.

Also, the narrator of this novel has mastered thoughts and mental situations of all characters. For instance, it writes “He (Laura’s son) is happy to see her, and more than happy; he is rescued, resurrected, transported by love. Laura reaches into the pocket of her robe for a cigarette, changes her mind, raises her hand instead to her hair…” (p.44), which indicates that the narrator is able to explain characters’ thoughts and even the intentions of their behaviour.

Furthermore, the narrator has predicted the future while allowing extensions of time and space in the story by writing at the end “And here she is, herself, Clarissa, not Mrs. Dalloway anymore; there is no one now to call her that. Here she is with another hour before her..... ‘Come in, Mrs. Brown,’ she says. ‘Everything’s ready (for the party)’” (p.226). It implies that the story will actually go into “another hour” ahead.
after the novel ends and more scenes can be assumed after Mrs. Brown joins the party.

In addition, the narrator has shown his command of historical and political background of the story too. Knowing the political background of Los Angeles in 1949, the narrator is able to provide one of the reasons for Laura to take her “role” in the family, as mentioned in the earlier section, that “Because the war is over” (p. 42).

The above has proven that the narrator in *The Hours* has owned a position beyond the characters and the story itself while not being one of the characters participating in the story, and it results in a demonstration of high level of narrative authority by its narrative mode.

As for *The Color Purple*, it has shown the type of narrative mode constructed by a narrator “participating in the story” ("同故事") + “bounded by the story” ("故事内") for the first-person narrative by the protagonist is presented. Participating in the story, the narrator is actually Celie the protagonist and it only narrates the whole story at a single position that “I” am telling “my” story in the letters written by her, which has maximizes the degree of participation of the narrator in the story. Since the narrator is
not omniscient like that of *The Hours*, Celie does not know anything about her sister after they are being separated until Shug tells her the truth and “Now that I know Albert hiding Nettie’s (her sister’s) letters” (p.126).

Apart from that, the narrator has not shown any acquaintance with feelings of other characters, such as Celie does not understand why her step-son is upset by his wife Sofia. She once says to her step-son “Sofia love you, she a good wife…. I don’t know what more you want” and is surprised by him answering “I want her to do what I say, like you do for Pa.” (p.63)

Despite of the fact that the narrative authority presented in *The Color Purple* is less than which of *The Hours*, this kind of narrative mode, according to Chan (2007), with the combination of the narrator and protagonist has represented a thorough participation of the narrator, leading to a significant figure of self-assertion to a high extent.

**B) The Narrative Voice**

Besides the narrative mode, Chan (2007) has introduced another aspect illustrating the narrative style adopted in novels, the narrative voice, representing the degree of
consciousness of the implied author behind the scene or, more precisely, how obvious the narrator “voices out” to remind his existence in the text. It is another important focus of the research as it reflects the power relationship between the narrator and the narratee as well as the implied reader shown in the text, where the way of communication by the implied author to the implied reader can be revealed.

The analysis has studied the concerned novels based on the four types of narrative voice concluded in Chan’s study (2007), referring to “the witness” (“在場者”, p.14), “the witness behind the scene” (“缺席的『在場者』”, p.14), a “semi-hidden voice” (“半隱蔽者”, p.14) and a “hidden voice” (“隱蔽者”, p.14). These four types of narrative voice will help distinguishing the level of self-consciousness of the “voice” by the narrator over the story.

Studying the first concerned novel *The Colour Purple*, it is not difficult to realize the type of narrative voice as a “hidden voice” (“隱蔽者”) with the epistolary voice as the first-person non-omniscient narrative applied in the story, whereas it has been exhibited by the consistent reminder of the presence of the narrator. In the first letter of Celie to God, she writes “I am fourteen years old. I am I have always been a good girl…” (p.1). Here, the narrator has changes the tense in the letter intentionally by
crossing out the unfinished clause, which is in fact “unnecessary” to the telling of the story (p.15, Chan, 2007), and it forms a possible signal of the self-consciousness of the narrator as female protagonist herself of the story.

At the same time, the implied readers of the novel are not clearly stated throughout the novel. For instance, the receivers of Celie’s letters are written at the beginning of each letter, where most letters are to “God” with a few to her sister “Nettie” at a latter stage. It is noticeable that apart from the first letter in which Celie requests the narratee, implying the implied readers, to listen to her story by writing “Maybe you can give me a sign letting me know what is happening to me” (p.1), there are not much traces of a direct communication between the implied author and the implied readers.

Although the narrator of The Color Purple is not omniscient as illustrated, Celie still takes charge of the description of all characters in her letters. An impressing example is the address of Celie’s husband in most of her letters where he is named “Mr. ________” by Celie. The readers do not even know the real name of her husband until the narrator allows Shug calls him “Albert” in a conversation between Celie and Shug. And so it is the narrator, Celie, who decides the standing of importance of a
particular character, declaring that the independent space of discourse is completely owned by the creator of this novel.

Unlike *The Color Purple*, the narrative voice in *The Hours* is reckoned as “the witness behind the scene” (缺席的『在場者』) with the third-person subjective narrative. In order to show the existence of an unknown narrator standing above the story, the narrator gives plenty of explanation to the characters’ behaviour, illustrating or commenting on their thoughts and attitudes towards different situations.

When Laura and her friend Kitty kiss each other, the narrator has made “comments” on the two female characters by writing “They are both afflicted and blessed, full of shared secrets, striving every moment. They are each impersonating someone. They are weary and beleaguered; they have taken on such enormous work” (p.110). With the description above, the narrator has affirmed and shown sympathy for the two women via a “strong voice”, and meanwhile, these comments from a “strong voice” has formed a force intervening the implied readers’ perception towards the concerned characters (p.16, Chan, 2007).
In her study on narrative approaches in various Chinese novels, Chan (2007) has pointed out that the degree of narrative authority over the story of the implied author can be illustrated by the type of narrative mode and narrative voice adopted in one’s fiction. Since “discourse” used in literature is a medium of transmitting intended messages by a “telling” subject, the narrator is then a medium for the implied author to demonstrate power and authority over the narratee and even the implied readers.

One may note that the degree of narrative authority shown by the narrator is determined by the narrative strategies applied by the implied author while the “narrator” has become an “alternative identity” of the author himself (p.21, Chan, 2007).

In relation to the issue of gender differences, it is stated that the author’s consciousness of gender is often projected on his narrative strategies applied on the narrator of the text (p.21, Chan, 2007). From Chan’s study (2007), it is concluded that the narrative authority in a text written by a male author appears to be generally higher than that of a text written by a female author. Talking about the narrative strategies used by authors with different genders, male authors usually create a narrator who is not involved in the story while the narrator tends to keep a distance
with the story, and hence it achieves high narrative authority. In converse, in texts written by female authors, the narrator usually follows the flow of the story and shows intense participation in the story. By these strategies, the narrator is able to present a closer distance to story yet the narrative authority is relatively lowered.

There are some reasons explaining the phenomenon above as suggested by Chan (2007) where the first factor is the perception of “authority” being a male-dominant characteristic. More importantly, due to literary paternity, male authors usually show more confidence in taking charge of “discourse” in a text, and thus men are more aware of showing their authority by presenting domination over the narrative of a story (p.23-24, Chan, 2007).

In response to the facts above, the narrative style reflecting the narrative authority of the two concerned novels has been analyzed and compared in this research. Reviewing the narrative style of *The Hours* analyzed in the previous part, it has involved the third-person subjective “witness behind the scene”; as a result the narrator is a symbol of the perfect “truth” in the novel. Thus, the narrative authority of the implied author has been constructed to the greatest extent in this novel.
On the other hand, there is narrative of a “hidden voice” found in *The Color Purple*, which implies a relatively low narrative authority of the implied author. Besides, there is also the use of “speech-like” language of the uneducated African-American Celie instead of formal written English throughout the text as well as the design of “I” (Celie) being the only source of information about things happening in the story. Comparing to the narrative authority of *The Hours*, these narrative strategies have strengthened a linkage between the narratee and the implied readers, when the narrative authority of the implied author is lowered due to the non-omniscient nature of the narrator.

Furthermore, the tendency of showing compassion for the female characters in *The Color Purple*, which is often regarded as a “female” characteristic, has again lessened the narrative authority of the implied author while the implied author of *The Hours* has managed to achieve the extreme authority over his story as described above. This comparison of the narrative authority shown in the two texts appears to match the findings presented in Chan’s study (2007) given that Cunningham, the author *The Hours*, has placed importance on his authority over his writing as a male author through the narrative style integrated in this analysis.
D) The Point of View

Moving on to the second issue reflecting the narrative approach used in the novels, the narrator’s point of view is an essential subject to be analyzed. The “point of view” of a novel refers to describing an occurrence from a particular perspective and it is one of the major determinants of the autonomy of implied author of a text and its “textuality of sex” (pp.20 & p.25, Chan, 2007).

W. Martin (1990) states that it is crucial to study the point of view of a text for two texts can convey different meanings even on a same theme when it is presented from various points of view. In short, point of view of a text is a demonstration of autonomy of the implied author. With the framework adapted from Chan’s study (2007), the points of view implied in the concerned novels of this research will be analyzed in three directions.

(i) “Insider” vs. “Outsider”

The points of view can be divided into types of “insider”, meaning a stress on the inner feelings of the characters, or “outsider” in which focusing on the factual description of the outer world (p.26). In The Color Purple, there is an obvious narration from Celie’s point of view and through the narration of the inner thoughts
and affections Celie, readers can experience the process of her transformation, from being double-marginalized as a Black woman to being psychologically liberated with a raise of self-esteem of character.

Through this approach, the author is capable of enhancing readers’ sympathy and compassion for Celie when they “participate” in the psychological change and personal growth of her. The significance of this approach is to reveal that women can be independent and take control over their own fate and it is believed to be the rationale for Walker to offer high autonomy to Celie the female protagonist in her novel. This emphasis on female character’s autonomy appears to match with the common practice of female authors as shown in Chan’s study (2007).

As a matter of fact, Chan (2007) has as well mentioned that male authors tend to choose a point of view as an “outsider” in their writing. However, Cunningham’s writing in *The Hours* has implied a trace of an “insider” perspective of the three female protagonists comparing to the obvious “outsider” perspective as a norm in male’s writing. In *The Hours*, the narrator often tells the thoughts of the female characters, for instance, association between “London”, “kisses” and “freedom” in Virginia’s mind and her plans about the characters in her book when describing
“…all London implies about freedom, about kisses…. Mrs. Dalloway, she thinks….to walk into so deeply she will never find her way back again” (p.172). It is shown that the aim of applying this approach is to raise the awareness of women’s liberation and to affirm its vital meaning to satisfying women’s mental needs.

(ii) “A Perspective from Female Characters” vs. “A Perspective from Male Characters”

In Chan’s study (2007), she realizes that male authors have shown a tendency to write from the perspective of male characters in order to re-affirm male’s domination over female due to the perception of literary paternity. On contrary, female authors usually reserve for female characters the autonomy to express self-affections and make own choices according to their will (Chan, 2007). Analyzing the studied novels in this research, Walker has written *The Color Purple* solely from the perspective of Celie, where the implied readers can only “see” the world from her point of view through her letters and thus her high degree of autonomy is achieved.

On the other hand, The Hours has also narrated the story from the perspectives of the female characters (Virginia, Laura and Clarissa) and hence shows respect to female’s autonomy on their own fates. For instance, Laura Brown’s wish and thoughts about
leaving her family for freedom is explained from her perspective in the novel, describing that “…For a moment she wants only to leave—not to harm him (her son), she’d never do that—but to be free, blameless, unaccountable” (p.78), indicating that her thought of liberation is in fact understandable and reasonable. This feature of implementing a female perspective in a male text has formed an infraction to the traditionally literary paternity as it uplifted the autonomy of female characters in the text.

(iii) “Individual Needs” vs. “Collective Interests”

Remarked by Chan (2007), the focus of a novel on the “individual needs” of a female character or the “collective interests” of the majority is influencing the decision making of the characters and the development of the plot in a story. In *The Color Purple*, Walker has applied a narrative style like a biography of herself, which is commonly appears in female texts for it is not difficult to spot the similarities between the life experience of Celie the character in the novel and that of Walker’s authentic history, such as being a victim of sexual abuse when young and later being a lesbian. As a result, Celie’s individual needs of being liberated and the benefits brought to the character by striving for liberation, including being financially and psychologically independent, has become an emphasis in this novel.
As for *The Hours*, the narrative style showing the self-consciousness of the female characters has indicated Cunningham’s respect and concern to these characters’ autonomy over their affections and decision of life. Besides, the autonomy of female characters has been strengthened for the protagonists’ wish to strive for liberation is designed to be inspired not by some other men but female characters. From the presentation above, it may have expressed Cunningham’s intention of raising sympathy and understanding for every woman’s individual needs of liberation, which is seldom seen in male texts under literary paternity.

However, one should not neglect the highlight of the consequences brought by the female characters who have chosen freedom instead of their families. It is remarkable that near the end of the novel, it is revealed that almost all the family members of them, especially the male characters, have suffered from the women’s decision of liberation. Clarissa Vaughn admits that she “abandon our (her) families to live alone in Canada….struggle to write books that do not change the world” (p.225) while Virginia Woolf has drowned herself after leaving a letter to her husband who loves her so much (as mentioned in the Prologue of the novel). Also, Laura Brown has been described to be “the woman who….fled her family, is alive when all the others, all those who struggled to survive in her wake, have passed away. She is alive now, after
her ex-husband has been carried off by liver cancer, after her daughter has been killed by a drunk driver. She is alive after Richard (her son) has jumped from a window onto a bed of broken glass” (p.222).

All these highlights above illustrating the impacts on others, mostly male characters, caused by women’s liberation have in fact clandestinely represented a moral criticism on the decision made by female from a male’s point of view, which can be an evidence of the curb of literary paternity to Cunningham’s attempt of overthrowing gender differences by his writing.

**Reflections of the Narrative Approaches on the Consciousness of Gender**

After integrating the traits of the narrative style in the two novels, the authors’ consciousness of gender implied in the texts, or “textuality of sex” (pp.20, Chan, 2007), can be inferred. Firstly, in terms of narrative authority, Cunningham has obviously achieved the greatest extend of authority over *The Hours* through the narrative strategies of the third-person subjective and omniscient strong “voice”, which is regarded to be inclining to the practice of male authors framed by literary paternity. As for *The Color Purple*, Walker has as well presented a relatively low narrative authority like that of most female’s writing with a few approaches showing
her attempt in overcoming literary paternity.

With respect to female autonomy, Walker has deliberately reinforced the autonomy of her female protagonist with a biographic-like female perspective, stressing the individual, mainly psychological needs, of women’s liberation in *The Color Purple*. Her expense of the degree of narrative authority using “speech” but not “writing” (p.19, Chan, 2007) in her text also reflects that she values much on self-autonomy as a feminist author.

It is worthy to indicate that *The Hours* is written in a female perspective showing the author’s respect to the autonomy of the female characters throughout the novel. Although as mentioned in the previous section there is one feature implying a male point of view over the criticism of consequences caused by women’s liberation at the end of the novel, the author has still presented a breakthrough of male’s thoughts on women’s liberation under literary paternity when constructing the inter-textual stories of these female characters.

**********************************
Responses on Women’s Liberation under Literary Paternity of the Two Novels

The experience of the four studied characters has proposed that the sense of “playing a role” is a universal struggle encountered by women in all contexts. Despite that both novels are developed based on the same feminist theme of “women’s liberation”, Walker, the author of The Color Purple, has apparently possessed an encouraging attitude towards women striving for liberation for the individual needs of self-autonomy. However, Cunningham who writes The Hours seems to have remarked a “warning” for the heavy price of sacrificing collective interests when women choose to liberation themselves from family burdens. It is believed that the difference of the implied foci is constructed by the narrative approaches in which the authors design for the two novels respectively.

When looking at the picture on whole, the two novels have represented an attempt to overthrow the dualistic gender differences in literature. According to the French Feminist view on literary criticism, the dual and hierarchical oppositions between genders set up by phallogocentric system is the ringleader of literary paternity colonizing women’s thinking. (Cixous & Clément, 1986). Applying the viewpoint of French Feminism, unlike The colour Purple which has clarified itself as a feminist writing via the demonstration of a narrative tone usually used by male authors, there
is no sufficient support illustrating *The Hours* as an intentionally feminist text.

Nevertheless, the recognition of features of narrative from a female’s perspective and detailed expression of thoughts and struggle of the female characters has indeed contributed to the significance of valuing “textuality of sex” (pp.20, Chan, 2007) in contemporary literature.

It is important to note that both novels have been written with a tendency towards “female narrative perspectives” (“女性”視點敘事)( pp.26, Chan, 2007), meaning a focus on describing inner affections and psychological situations, allowing female being the subject to “see” in the story with her autonomy to take control over her own fate and the recognition of women’s self-consciousness as well as needs, and meanwhile showing some features of usual practice by male authors. The novels have thus represented a hermaphroditic character of the authors which is claimed to be the ideal and essential writer’s character by Virginia Woolf (1929) and declare a significant commencement of the destruction of gender duality in phallogocentric system as a mean of women’s liberation.

In addition, the homosexual and bisexual elements portrayed in the novels appear to demonstrate subversion of social and political patriarchy for women rejecting to be
the subordinating products of men (Irigaray, 1985). These elements of the texts can be regarded as a further challenge to the duality of gender.

Conclusion

To conclude, the two novels, *The Hours* and *The Color Purple*, have both revealed the reasons for and means to achieve women’s liberation under literary paternity. The narrative approaches of the two novels have also attempted to question the value for the insistence on dualistic gender differences in literature, for the word “gender” is in fact a “performance” only just as implied in *The Colour Purple* where Shug tells about a sexual hobby adapted by Albert and her that she “used to put on Albert’s pants when we (they) was courting. And he one time put on my (Shug’s) dress” (p.147).

Reference:


Chan, S.H. (2007). *中國當代文學的敘事與性別 (增訂版)* (*Narrative and Gender*...


*Cycle of Liberation—Reflections on Social Justice*, last accessed on 6th June, 2011

[http://home.comcast.net/~cycleofliberation/defineliberation.html](http://home.comcast.net/~cycleofliberation/defineliberation.html)

Definition of *Oppression* from WordNet, a lexical database for English, Princeton University (2011), last accessed on 2nd May, 2011

[http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?w=oppression&o2=&o0=1&o7=&o5=&o1=1&o6=&o4=&o3=&h](http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?w=oppression&o2=&o0=1&o7=&o5=&o1=1&o6=&o4=&o3=&h)


Ortner, S. (1998). “Is Female to Male as Nature is to Culture?” In “Chapter 1:


